
APPLICATION NO.	23/00041/FULLN
APPLICATION TYPE	FULL APPLICATION - NORTH
REGISTERED	04.01.2023
APPLICANT	Mr I Johnston And Miss R Kirby
SITE	North Croye, The Avenue, Andover, SP10 3EL, ANDOVER TOWN (MILLWAY)
PROPOSAL	Demolish existing garages and single storey side extension, erect two storey side extension
AMENDMENTS	None received.
CASE OFFICER	Gillian Wheeler

Background paper (Local Government Act 1972 Section 100D)
[Click here to view application](#)

1.0 INTRODUCTION

1.1 This application is presented to the Northern Area Planning Committee at the request of a Member.

2.0 SITE LOCATION AND DESCRIPTION

2.1 North Croye is a predominantly two storey dwelling of brick and tile construction, with a single storey side projection to the south-east, and a double garage linked to the dwelling by the utility room to the north-west of the dwelling. North Croye is located within a large plot within Residential Area of Special Character (RASC) Andover 1D: The Pines. There are mature trees located towards the front of the site which are protected by Tree Preservation Orders (TPOs).

3.0 PROPOSAL

3.1 The application seeks permission for the demolition of the existing north-western side single storey double garage and utility room, and the erection of a two storey side extension with a porch canopy together with a replacement porch on the existing dwelling.

3.2 The proposed two storey extension would have a width of approximately 8.5 metres, a depth of approximately 5.8 metres, and a height of approximately 7.6 metres. It would be constructed of materials to match the existing dwelling.

4.0 HISTORY

4.1 20/00058/FULLN - Extension and alterations to existing house and erection of two detached dwellings with garages. Withdrawn 10.03.20

4.2 22/02043/FULLN - Single storey rear/side extension and revised fenestration to ground floor rear elevation. Permitted subject to conditions and notes 05.10.22.

4.3 22/02568/FULLN - Demolish existing garages and single storey side extension, erect two storey side extension. Application withdrawn 19.12.22.

5.0 **CONSULTATIONS**

5.1 None.

6.0 **REPRESENTATIONS** Expired 31.01.2023

6.1 **Andover Town Council: No comments received.**

6.2 **5 letters of support have been received from Little Croye, 3 The Pines, 2 The Pines, Kristen House and 7 The Pines, and are summarised as follows:**

- The existing dwelling is run down and poorly built.
- The proposals would turn it into a well-designed and attractive family home.
- The house has been slowly deteriorating over the last 20 years.
- The initial garden work underway across the whole site has shown its potential.
- The demolition of the poorly built garage and extension will open the way for this major expansion.
- The proposals would turn it into a comfortable family home.
- This older property is finally receiving the attention it deserves.
- The view of the house from the driveway will be much enhanced once the current mix of flat and pitched roofs is replaced by the proposed attractive two storey extension.
- This house is the first you come to as you pass down the avenue of mature trees, which is the entry road to The Pines. These well-considered proposals will enhance the area.
- The house has gradually become dilapidated over twenty years.
- The proposals would create a modern family home.
- We welcome and understand the need to extend and re-design the aged interior of the property.
- The replacement of the existing garages with a two storey extension can only improve the external appearance.
- The house lies well below the level of our lane and is well-screened by trees and shrubs, so the impact to passers-by is likely to be minimal.
- The proposal looks like it will tidy up what was a random group of add-on buildings/garages with both pitched and flat roofs.
- The house is in dire need of modernisation and this proposal will turn it into a lovely family home.
- The house is sheltered from view due to mature trees and shrubs.
- There is plenty of parking available for numerous cars so the loss of the garages should not cause issues with parking.
- North Croye is a well-hidden house which lies below the street level of The Pines.
- It is surrounded by beautiful mature trees.
- The house has become tired and dated and it now needs considerable work to bring it up to today's standards and in-line with the adjacent houses.

- The plan for a two storey extension is both visually pleasing and a great improvement to the existing building.

7.0 **POLICY**

7.1 Government Guidance

National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF)
National Planning Practice Guidance (NPPG)

7.2 Test Valley Borough Revised Local Plan (2016)(TVBRLP)

Policy SD1 – Presumption in Favour of Sustainable Development
Policy COM2 – Settlement Hierarchy
Policy E1- High Quality Development in the Borough
Policy E2 – Protect, Conserve and Enhance the Landscape Character of the Borough
Policy E4 – Residential Areas of Special Character
Policy E5 – Biodiversity
Policy LHW4 – Amenity
Policy T1 – Managing Movement
Policy T2 – Parking Standards

7.3 Supplementary Planning Documents (SPD)

Residential Areas of Special Character Supplementary Planning Document, January 2019.
Final Andover RASC Appraisal January 2018

8.0 **PLANNING CONSIDERATIONS**

8.1 The main planning considerations are:

- Principle of development
- Impact on the character and appearance of the area
- Impact on trees and landscape
- Impact on amenity of neighbouring property
- Impact on ecology
- Impact on parking provision and highway safety

8.2 **Principle of development**

The site lies within the Andover settlement boundary as defined on the Inset Maps of the TVBRLP. In accordance with Policy COM2 of the TVBRLP development is permitted provided that the proposal is appropriate to the other policies of the Revised Local Plan. The proposal is assessed against the relevant policies below.

8.3 **Impact on the character and appearance of the area**

Policy E1 of the TVBRLP states that development will be permitted if it integrates, respects and complements the character of the area in which the development is permitted, in terms of layout, appearance, scale, materials and building styles.

- 8.4 Policy E1 also states that extensions or alterations can have a cumulative impact on the character of the area and can overwhelm an existing building to the extent that its original character and symmetry is significantly eroded. To minimise this the proposal would need to be subsidiary to the original building and not dominate in scale.
- 8.5 Policy E4 states that development within Residential Areas of Special Character will be permitted provided that the development's size, scale, layout, type, siting and detailed design are compatible with the Residential Area of Special Character. The supporting text to Policy E4 also states that the policy does not intend to prevent development, but aims to retain their distinctive local character through the control of sub division of plots or extension to existing buildings leading to higher density development and impact on those aspects that make special character.
- 8.6 The Residential Area of Special Character Supplementary Planning Document (RASC SPD) states that a Residential Area of Special Character is an established residential area of high quality and with an identity, which sets it apart from the remainder of the urban environment as a whole. Residential Areas of Special Character can be defined by their street pattern, built form and landscape quality.
- 8.7 The RASC SPD also states that these areas have a recognisable pattern of development which is characterised by low density and that building form should reflect the characteristics of the vicinity, particularly; height, width of frontage, number of storeys, and form of roof.
- 8.8 Regarding RASC Andover 1D: The Pines, the RASC SPD states that despite and partly because of the variety of characters within the three distinct parts of the Character Area: wooded access drive, central larger plots with irregular forms and regular development at the southern end, the whole has a very distinctive feel. The Andover RASC Appraisal (2018) identifies that in The Pines Character Area the balance of properties consists of dwellings that were built in the 1980s or later. Kristen House and North Croye are identified specifically as two houses which are different to this and thought to be immediately pre and post-war. It is considered that the identification of North Croye in the Appraisal as a building of this period is because of its difference to the majority of the properties in The Pines. It therefore contributes positively to the special character of the RASC in a different way to the majority of the other properties in this character area. As such, it is considered important that any extension to the North Croye respects and complements this original character in order to retain the distinctive local character of the RASC.
- 8.9 North Croye is set within a large plot, and the dwelling already has a fairly large footprint, but this is mitigated by the single storey and set-back nature of the existing side element of the dwelling to the south-east, and the single storey nature of the existing garage, and due to the visual separation of the

dwelling and garage by the arched doorway between the two, which helps to reduce the impact of the scale of the dwelling, and ensures that the dwelling has a more modest appearance, in keeping with the character of the area and the surrounding properties within the RASC.

- 8.10 The proposed two storey extension would have a width of approximately 8.5 metres, in comparison to the width of the two storey part of the existing dwelling, which is approximately 9.9 metres, and the two storey part of the dwelling would therefore be almost doubled in width following the proposed extension, at approximately 18.4 metres. This would not be sufficiently subservient to the host dwelling and would erode the original character of the dwelling, contrary to Policy E1.
- 8.11 Little Croye and Kristen House are the two most comparable dwellings to North Croye within the RASC, and both are two storey detached dwellings within larger and less uniform plots than numbers 1-8 The Pines. Kristen House has a two storey width of approximately 10.5 metres and Little Croye has a two storey width of approximately 12.5 metres, and it has a 1.5 storey partially over-lapping front gable element which is subordinate to the remainder of the dwelling. The dwellings of numbers 1-8 The Pines have overall widths of between 13 and 14 metres including their attached garages, many of which have been extended over, but the original size of the dwellings remains appreciable. Numbers 1-8 The Pines form a cul-de-sac with 4 dwellings facing each other each side, and have a strong degree of uniformity, due to their size, design and materials.
- 8.12 The proposed width of North Croye would not respect the scale of the other dwellings in the RASC as it would be a much wider dwelling overall, with a width of approximately 30.7 metres including the single storey part to the south-east, and the extension would not be proportionately subservient to the host dwelling due to the width of the proposed extension almost doubling the existing two storey width.
- 8.13 The proposed extension would be visible from the existing vehicle entrance to the site, and glimpsed views would be possible between and over the trees which border The Pines access road. North Croye is the first dwelling within The Pines when approaching from The Avenue. Little Croye and Kristen House are sited within closer proximity to each other out of the three larger dwellings, and have a shared access from The Pines.
- 8.14 Currently North Croye is comparable within the street scene to Little Croye and Kristen House, but the proposed extension would result in a much larger dwelling than existing, which would no longer be in keeping with these other two properties within the RASC, which would detract from the recognisable pattern of built form within the RASC, which contributes positively to its special character.

- 8.15 Further attention would be drawn to the proposed extension at North Croye through the addition of the front porch canopy, which further adds to the bulk and mass of the proposal, and increases the visual weight on the extended north-western end of the dwelling, particularly as it would be the most ornate porch within the RASC, which is characterised by dwellings with simple frontages, and this would also be publicly visible from the existing vehicle entrance to North Croye.
- 8.16 There is a recently approved planning permission referenced 22/02043/FULLN for a single storey side extension to the south-east of the property, which if implemented in addition to the proposed two storey extension, would further add to the mass and bulk of the dwelling, and would result in a dwelling far larger than the other dwellings within the RASC. The cumulative impact of the extensions would overwhelm the existing building to the extent that its original character and symmetry would be significantly eroded, which is contrary to Policy E1.
- 8.17 Neighbours have stated that the site is well-screened by trees and shrubs. However, the existing trees and vegetation partially screening the site from the road cannot be relied upon in perpetuity to make the proposed extension acceptable. Whilst the large trees at the front of the site are protected by TPOs, if they become diseased or dangerous, they would have to be removed. Whilst the council could ensure that these trees were replaced, any new trees would take time to become sufficiently established in order to act as a screen for the development. The shrubs and front boundary hedging could also be removed at any time.
- 8.18 The claims that the existing property is run-down and dilapidated and that the proposals would result in a modern, comfortable family home do not form a material planning consideration in the determination of this application. No viability report has been submitted to demonstrate that the existing dwelling could not be renovated without a two storey side extension.
- 8.19 The enlarged dwelling would not respect or complement the character of the area due to its proposed scale, which would not respect or complement the scale of the other dwellings within the RASC. Furthermore, the proposed extension would not be subservient or proportionate to the scale of the host dwelling and would erode its original character and symmetry which are considered to contribute positively to the special character of the RASC. The dwelling would appear incongruous within public views due to its increased mass and bulk in comparison to nearby properties and the unbalancing of the property as a whole, and would be contrary to Policies E1 and E4 of the TVBRLP and the Residential Areas of Special Character Supplementary Planning Document.
- 8.20 **Impact on trees**
Policy E2 of the TVBRLP states that development will be permitted provided that it does not result in the loss of important local features such as trees.

- 8.21 The RASC SPD states that trees and mature gardens are an important and prevalent landscape feature in RASC, and that the positioning of mature trees within private gardens often defines the plot boundary providing a sylvan setting as well as contributing to the high level of amenity that RASC experience. Development within RASC needs to be sensitively located to ensure they do not encroach upon the roots of healthy trees with the objective of preserving existing trees as much as possible.
- 8.22 There are mature trees located and towards the front of the site which are protected by TPOs. The proposed two storey extension would be located on a similar footprint to the existing garage, and no additional hardstanding is proposed for parking. A tree protection plan has been submitted to support the application. The proposals are therefore in compliance with Policy E2 of the TVBRLP.
- 8.23 **Impact on amenity of neighbouring property**
Policy LHW4 of the TVBRLP states that development will be permitted provided that it provides for the privacy and amenity of its occupants and those of neighbouring properties, and provided that it does not reduce the levels of daylight and sunlight reaching new and existing properties or private open space to below acceptable levels.
- 8.24 By virtue of the size (bulk and mass) and design of the proposal and its significant separation from neighbouring properties, the proposal would not give rise to an adverse impact on the living conditions of neighbouring properties by virtue of loss of daylight, sun light or privacy. The proposals are therefore in accordance with Policy LHW4 of the TVBRLP.
- 8.25 **Impact on ecology**
Policy E5 of the TVBRLP states that development in the Borough that will conserve, and where possible, restore and / or enhance biodiversity will be permitted.
- 8.26 A Preliminary Roost Assessment has been submitted in support of this application. The dwelling on site was assessed as having negligible bat roost potential, and no further surveys or mitigation has been recommended in respect to roosting bats.
- 8.27 The proposal is not considered to give rise to any adverse impacts on existing habitat or on-site ecology, in accordance with Policy E5 of the TVBRLP.
- 8.28 **Impact on parking and highway safety**
Policy T1 states that development will be permitted provided that it does not have an adverse impact on the function, safety and character of and accessibility to the local or strategic highway network or rights of way network.
- 8.29 Policy T2 of the TVBRLP states that parking provisions should be well designed and appropriately located so as to be convenient to users.

- 8.30 Annex G of the TVBRLP states that a 4 bedroom dwelling should provide 3 parking spaces within its curtilage. The proposed block plan demonstrates that the dwelling can accommodate 3 parking spaces within the curtilage, and that vehicles can exit the site by way of a 3 point turn.
- 8.31 The proposal includes the demolition of the garage which currently provides two parking spaces for the dwelling. Policy T2 of the TVBRLP states that garage parking spaces must have the internal dimensions of 3 metres by 6 metres to be considered as parking spaces. However, the existing garage does not meet these requirements.
- 8.32 Whilst the necessity of a 3 point turn would not be entirely convenient for occupiers of the dwelling, it is possible for 3 vehicles to park and safely enter and exit the site in a forward gear. No changes to the existing access arrangements into the site are proposed. It is considered that the proposal would not have an adverse impact on the function, safety or character of the highway. The proposals are therefore in accordance with Policies T1, T2 and Annex G of the TVBRLP.

9.0 CONCLUSION

- 9.1 The proposals could be carried out without detriment to the health and future vitality of on-site trees, without an adverse impact to protected species and would not cause an adverse impact on the amenity of neighbouring properties. In addition, the proposals would not adversely impact the function and safety of the highway network. However, the width of the proposed dwelling would not respect or complement the character of the area, the character of the RASC or the scale of the host property, eroding its symmetry and overwhelming the property. The dwelling would therefore appear incongruous within public views due to its increased mass and bulk in comparison to nearby properties and would erode the original character and symmetry of North Crove which are considered to contribute positively to the special character of the RASC. The proposal would be contrary to Policies COM2, E1 and E4 of the TVBRLP and the Residential Areas of Special Character Supplementary Planning Document.

10.0 RECOMMENDATION

REFUSE for the reason:

- 1. The dwelling would be overwhelmed by the extension and would appear incongruous in public views due to its increased mass and bulk in comparison to nearby properties. The extension would erode the original character and symmetry of North Crove, which are characteristics that are considered to contribute positively to the special character of the Andover RASC. Furthermore, the proposed extension would not be subservient or proportionate to the scale of the host dwelling due to its width. The proposal would not integrate, respect or complement the character of the area nor is it considered that the scale of the enlarged dwelling would be compatible with the character of the Andover RASC,**

specifically Character Area: Andover 1D, The Pines. The proposal would be contrary to Policies COM2, E1 and E4 of the Test Valley Borough Revised Local Plan (2016), the Residential Areas of Special Character Supplementary Planning Document (January 2019) and the Andover Residential Areas of Special Character Appraisal (January 2018).

Note to applicant:

- 1 In reaching this decision Test Valley Borough Council (TVBC) has had regard to the National Planning Policy Framework and takes a positive and proactive approach to development proposals focused on solutions. TVBC work with applicants and their agents in a positive and proactive manner offering a pre-application advice service and updating applicants/agents of issues that may arise in dealing with the application and where possible suggesting solutions.**
-